

**Meeting Agenda
Design and Historic Review Board
February 20, 2018
Room 241 / 2:00 p.m.**

- I. Call to Order**
- II. Roll Call**
- III. Approval of Minutes**
- IV. Chair Report**
- V. Public Hour - Hearing of Citizens**
- VI. Work Program**
 - A. 2018 Holtzman Award
- VII. Official Reports and Correspondence**
 - A. Borough Council
 - B. Planning Commission
- VIII. Adjournment**

Documents:

Complete DHRB Agenda - February 20, 2018.pdf

**Meeting Agenda
State College Borough
Design and Historic Review Board
February 20, 2018
Room 241 / 2 p.m.**

I. Call to Order

II. Roll Call

Eric Boeldt, Chairman
Richard Bryant, Vice-Chairman
Richard Devon
Laird Jones
Bond Reinhardt
Wendy Schneider
Eric White

III. Approval of Minutes – *January 16 and February 6, 2018*

IV. Chair Report

V. Public Hour - Hearing of Citizens

VI. Work Program

A. 2018 Holtzman Award

The Ingrid P. Holtzman award is given at the annual ABC Dinner to an individual or organization that provides a quality design project to the community.

The design project can meet many of the following guidelines:

- Incorporates local artwork
- Provides a public space for community events or is a charitable use (i.e., affordable housing)
- Uses elegant building materials, innovated plantings, and sustainable products
- Blends neighborhoods and maintains the historic character of the property/neighborhood
- Provides a nice site and has outstanding design features
- Is deemed a benchmark project

Additional information on the award is provided beginning on **Page 11**. The link to view previous recipients is:

<http://www.statecollegepa.us/1728/Holtzman-Award>

Design and Historic Review Board Action: Discuss possible candidates for the 2018 Holtzman Award. Nominate three potential candidates for consideration.

VII. Official Reports and Correspondence

A. Borough Council

B. Planning Commission

VIII. Adjournment

**Meeting Minutes
State College Borough
Design and Historic Review Board
January 16, 2018**

The State College Borough Design and Historic Review Board (DHRB) met on Tuesday, January 16, 2018, in the Municipal Building, 243 South Allen Street. Chairman Boeldt called the meeting to order at 2:01 p.m.

Members Present

Eric Boeldt, Chairman; Richard Bryant; Richard Devon; Laird Jones; Wendy Schneider; and Eric White

Other Present

Anne Messner, Planner/Zoning Officer; Alan Sam, Arborist; Denise L. Rhoads, Administrative Assistant; Brian O'Connor, Cube 3 Studio; and Brandt Stiles, Collegiate Development Group (CDG)

Election of Officers

A motion to nominate Mr. Boeldt for Chairman was made by Dr. White and seconded by Ms. Schneider. The vote was unanimously in favor.

A motion to nominate Mr. Bryant for Vice-Chairman was made by Mr. Boeldt and seconded by Mr. Devon. The vote was unanimously in favor.

Approval of Minutes

A motion was made by Mr. Devon and seconded by Ms. Schneider to approve the meeting minutes from December 19, 2017 as submitted. The vote was unanimously in favor.

Chair Report

Chairman Boeldt had nothing to report.

Public Hour

No one in the audience wished to discuss items not on the agenda.

Sign

New Sign, GoPuff, 206 West Hamilton Avenue, CP3 Zoning District

Ms. Messner stated this new business had already installed a sign before coming to this Board. She noted this business was a delivery service.

After a brief discussion, the DHRB approved the sign.

312, 322, 324, 332, 338 West College Avenue and 109 and 113 South Atherton Street
Final Plan, Commercial Incentive District with Signature Development Project,
Collegiate Development Group, Developer, Cube 3, Architect, Penn Terra, Engineering

Ms. Messner stated the CDG, proposed to consolidate the seven parcels and build a mixed-use building. CDG proposed to include underground parking, two floors of non-residential use and the remaining ten floors to be multi-family housing. They also proposed to provide the inclusionary housing units on site.

Ms. Messner noted the project would be under the Signature Development Conditional Use Permit allowed in the Commercial Incentive Zoning District. A conditional use was also requested to modify the bedroom mix for the affordable units. The conditional use permits were granted by Council in 2017. The inclusionary housing mix was modified and the affordable units would be 32-bedroom units to maintain the 62 bedrooms required in the building.

Ms. Messner stated the applicant made modifications to the building to respond to comments made during the preliminary plan and conditional permit review process.

Mr. O'Conner - Cube 3 Studio's presentation included:

- This project proposed at the West College Avenue/Atherton Street intersection.
- 277,700 square feet for residential use.
- 243 units with 30 of those units used for inclusionary housing – approximately 745 beds.
- Equivalent to 429 parking spaces in three levels of parking below grade.
- Ground floor level retail along West College Avenue.
- Leasing office would be on the corner of West Calder Way/Burrowes Street.
- Proposed retail drop-off/pickup and refuse area on the West Calder Way side.
- Proposed second floor would be for office and amenity spaces and would be arranged around the outdoor courtyard.
- The remaining floors would hold typical apartment spaces.
- Materials discussed were tan/white pre-cast concrete, metal frames, and a glass store front glazing system.
- Proposed mid-block connector.
- Exterior design strategy discussed: 1) projected gray volumes on primary building mass would create scale and rhythm; 2) two layers of texture would reinforce the massing moves; 3) tan/white precast panels and storefront glazing would create a strong vertical rhythm that would define the primary building mass.
- Colors of the first two floors would match the top two floors. Mr. O'Connor brought samples of the materials for the Board to review.
- Construction would start sometime in June 2018.

The DHRB's comments included:

- Mr. Devon stated there was a need to have an area for Uber and Lyft customers.
- Mr. Devon stated the building was too massive.
- Mr. Bryant stated he liked the "stepped back" approach at the top level and noted this was a noble effort on the part of the developers.

- Mr. Boeldt stated the retail delivery system did not work for the Metropolitan and was hoping this project would find a way to make it work.
- Dr. White asked if there was a name for the style of the building. The developer stated there was not. Dr. White stated this style of building may not last for the next 40 or 50 years.
- Mr. Jones asked how well did the architects expect the colored concrete to hold up. Mr. O'Connor stated they were working closely with the manufacturers on this.
- Mr. Jones asked what drove the decision to use concrete. Mr. O'Connor stated it was the durability of the product.
- Mr. Bryant asked where the inclusionary housing units would be. Mr. O'Connor stated they would be split among all floors.
- Ms. Messner asked what the installation system would look like. Mr. O'Connor stated it would be the precast concrete.

Alan Sam, Borough Arborist, stated he did not see a developed landscaping plan yet. Mr. O'Connor stated the developers were not there yet.

Mr. Boeldt asked staff to share the following comments with the Planning Commission and Borough Council: 1) the Board was concerned they did not have the right tools or guidance to make decisions on these projects; and 2) the consensus was the building project met ordinance, but the Board would like more direction regarding how these facades should be designed from Council. Ms. Messner stated this would be information staff could pass on to the consultants for the zoning rewrite.

Land Development Plan

1500 South Atherton Street and 1519 Science Street, Preliminary Plan and Lot Consolidation Foxdale Village Staff Development Center, owner, Nittany Engineering & Associates, Engineer, RLPS Architects, LLP

This land development plan was deferred to the next DHRB meeting due to the presenters' absence.

Official Reports and Correspondence

Borough Council (BC): Ms. Messner reported there would be a public hearing and a decision for the Garner Street parking lot project at a February 2018 meeting.

Planning Commission (PC): Ms. Messner reported the PC would meet January 18, 2018 and would review the 312, 322, 324, 332, 338 West College Avenue and 109 and 113 South Atherton Street Final Plan.

2018 Conflict of Interest Memorandum: Members received this document in their agenda and Ms. Messner reported staff was required to distribute this information annually.

Mr. Boeldt asked Ms. Messner if the zoning rewrite was still in progress. Ms. Messner stated it was and staff was waiting for the first draft. She noted consultants asked staff to review it first.

Mr. Boeldt asked how the Historical and Architectural Review Board process was coming along. Ms. Messner stated staff had a conversation, today, with the consultants and discussed what guidelines should be addressed. She noted a survey would be posted online via the Borough's Heritage State College web page.

Adjournment

With no further business to discuss, Vice-Chairman Bryant adjourned the meeting at 3:03 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,
Denise L. Rhoads, Administrative Assistant

**Meeting Minutes
State College Borough
Design and Historic Review Board
February 6, 2018**

The State College Borough Design and Historic Review Board (DHRB) met on Tuesday, February 6, 2018, in the Municipal Building, 243 South Allen Street. Chairman Boeldt called the meeting to order at 2:00 p.m.

Members Present

Eric Boeldt, Chairman; Richard Devon; Laird Jones; and Wendy Schneider

Members Absent

Richard Bryant, Vice-Chairman; W. Bond Rhinehart; and Eric White

Others Present

Anne Messner, Planner/Zoning Officer; Alan Sam, Arborist; Jenna Wargo, Planner; and Judy Altieri, Office Manager

Approval of Minutes – January 16, 2018

Several Board members made comments regarding their discussion at the previous meeting on the proposed land development plan at West College Avenue and South Atherton Street (Collegiate Development Group), indicating the Board questioned their ability to make decisions on the plan because they did not have the right tools and were frustrated with the process. Mr. Boeldt indicated the building did meet the requirements, but it was far from being fine.

Ms. Messner noted there had been consensus and the building met the requirements of the ordinance. She noted the minutes from that meeting would be edited and brought back for review and approval.

She continued, adding the consulting team heard the Boards' concerns and they were looking at other options, but she did not have a good sense of the direction they planned to take.

The Board continued to discuss other feasible options for reducing the overall volume of the proposed building. Ms. Messner noted that until the zoning rewrite project was completed, the Borough was limited on what design aspects they could control as it was written in the zoning ordinance. Mr. Devon noted the Board was the only gatekeeper of building facades, which would dictate the future of State College.

Chair Report

Mr. Boeldt indicated he had recently presented the DHRB's annual report to Borough Council, highlighting 2017 activities as well as their plans for 2018.

Public Hour - Hearing of Citizens

There was no one who spoke during the Public Hour.

Land Development Plans

1500 South Atherton Street and 1519 Science Street, Preliminary Plan and Lot Consolidation Foxdale Village Staff Development Center, Owner, Nittany Engineering & Associates, Engineer, RLPS Architects, LLP

Representatives from Foxdale Village and Nittany Engineering presented information to the Board regarding their plans for lot consolidation, an existing office building, and parking lot.

Tibben Zerby, Nittany Engineering, presented the Board with GIS aerial maps from 2006 and 2014 to highlight the history of the properties. He presented details related to the resurfacing of the parking lot and renovations to the office building. In general, they planned to clean up the site, add landscaping elements, and incorporate several rain gardens. He noted plans to add a ramp and sidewalks to the rear of the building that would help tie access into the rear lot.

Adam Day, Foxdale Village, indicated they planned to use the building for Human Resource office space, meeting rooms, and career development for Foxdale staff. He added they planned to make the office building similar to campus, by changing the roof structure and matching the existing façade (brick & vinyl siding). He added the enhanced parking area would help the campus out tremendously, because they relied upon their neighbors and street parking daily. Lastly, he noted the building's sign design had not been completed yet.

Mr. Sam asked several questions related to the rain gardens design. He suggested the center island be designed as a bioswale. He also suggested the team look at the parking lot over at Millbrook Marsh. Mr. Zerby noted there was a plan to install several curb cuts to allow the water into the rain gardens.

Mr. Sam also noted there was a tree by the lower driveway that may have to be removed. He suggested they move access for the parking lot to avoid cutting the tree, adding the removal would cost Foxdale approximately \$2,000. Ms. Messner noted if the curb cuts were already in place for the parking lot, they would predate the ordinance and could be used as part of the project. If the curb cuts were relocated, they would have to abide by the current ordinance.

Mr. Sam also noted after the development was complete, the Borough would consider planting street trees along Science Street. Mr. Day asked Mr. Sam about the trees located on Atherton Street, noting they were in rough shape. Mr. Sam indicated they were not Borough trees. He stated he could make recommendations for that area as well.

Board comments included:

- Liked that the structure will blend in with the rest of the Foxdale campus.
- Not fond of red brick, but general design is nice.
- Liked the improved parking area that included rain garden elements, i.e., grasses, small trees, shrubs, and sage.

Final Plan, Memorial Field Phase 2, State College Area School District, Owner, ROA Zoning District, PennTerra Engineering, Inc. and Urban Engineers, Engineers, Weber Murphy Fox, Inc., Architect

Representatives from PennTerra Engineering and Weber Murphy Fox presented the final land development plan to the Board, which proposed additional modifications to the Memorial Field complex. The school district planned to demolish the offices in the existing building and in its place, renovations would provide amenity space for the use of patrons. The basement would house restrooms, classroom meeting space, and storage. Bleacher work and improved access to the playing field was also proposed.

Anna Childe, Weber Murphy Fox, began the presentation, highlighting the removal of the stone foundation up to the district's office building, removing old bleachers, new walkways, ramps, and connections, multiple entry locations, new ticket booths, public restrooms, and a new concession area.

She added the new concession area would help to increase parking space along Fraser Street and the finished project would accommodate almost 3,000 seats.

She added there were plans to improve the landscaping elements and they would be working with the Borough for planting recommendations. She added there were no plans to use brick on the site, except for some along the sidewalk area. Exterior elements would include similar stone work for new field walls with recessed mortar work. She explained they preferred to use the natural product and the design team was "OK" with the minor differences. The new building's façade would include some multi colored concrete blocks and metal panels. She noted some of the center bleachers would also include seatbacks in school colors. She added they hoped to repurpose some of the exterior window elements on the new ticket booth to help blend the old with the new.

Ms. Childe continued, reminding the Board of the existing sinkhole that continued to take care of a lot of storm water for the Borough. She noted any additional work on that system was beyond the current project. Robert Lingenfelter, Weber Murphy Fox, stated he was working with the Borough Engineer on an easement agreement that would continue to allow Borough access to the drainage system. He also noted the Borough was exploring installation of a stormceptor unit to aid in cleaning the storm water flow.

Mr. Sam asked if the existing stone wall, along Sidney Friedman Park, would be raised. Mr. Lingenfelter indicated it would be raised and a fence would be reinstalled.

Board comments included:

- Liked the practical approach taken for additional stonework walls.
- Liked the natural product that would continue to change over time.
- Did not think the historical building, designed by a nationally recognized architect, should be demolished.
- Put up a sign or plaque to memorialize the old building.
- Plenty of parking available on Borough streets and garages.
- Work with Borough Arborist to determine best plantings along bike path, bank stabilization.

The Board continued to make comments regarding the planned demolition of the existing historical building.

Mr. Boeldt motioned to note the Board was disappointed with the SCASD's plan to remove the building but was appreciative of the use of natural stone for the project. Ms. Schneider seconded the motion. The motion was approved (3-1) with Mr. Devon abstaining from the vote.

Work Program

2018 Work Program

Ms. Messner noted the Board's 2018 Work Program was approved by Council without edits. She asked the Board to start thinking about possible Holtzman Award nominations as well as taking a few minutes to prioritize the work items listed in the program.

Mr. Boeldt suggested the Historical and Architectural Review Board (HARB) review, etc., be listed as their highest priority item. Ms. Messner reminded the Board there was nothing to review yet and updates related to the zoning rewrite would be reviewed by multiple groups.

Mr. Boeldt suggested the DHRB be invited to upcoming ZRAC meetings.

Ms. Schneider confirmed there would be some reorganization of the DHRB when the HARB was formalized sometime in June or July of 2018.

Ms. Wargo noted the Borough would soon be accepting applications for the HARB membership, reminding the Board the formal appointments would be made by Borough Council.

Mr. Devon suggested that Dan Willis from the Penn State campus come and speak about the changing population density of State College.

Official Reports and Correspondence

Borough Council

Ms. Messner noted Council had reviewed the Conditional Use Permit request that was submitted for the Garner Street development project.

Planning Commission

Ms. Messner indicated the Commission would review both Land Development Plans the Board reviewed at this meeting.

Adjournment

With no further business to discuss, Chairman Boeldt adjourned the meeting at 3:26 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Judy Altieri
Office Manager

The “Ingrid”

In 1999, Dr. Paul Holtzman (husband of Ingrid) and his son Douglas established a fund to commemorate Paul's late wife Ingrid P. Holtzman. Each year, in recognition of Ingrid's years of service to the Borough, \$1,000.00 is given to a worthy individual, organization, company, or corporation who has enhanced, promoted, or maintained the aesthetic appearance of the Borough. The Manager approves the recipient based upon the recommendation of the Design Review Board.

In **2000**, the first recipients were Joel Malnick and Sarah Twibell for improving the preservation and adaptive reuse of 310 and 314 South Burrowes Street.

Andrew and Catherine Zangrilli received the **2001** award. This couple has done many things for the betterment of State College, as evidenced by the restoration of the building that houses Café Zio and the long-time treatment of The Deli. Catherine contributes her talent and time to such things as the Downtown State College Partnership's design committee and to designing State College's welcoming signs.

In **2002**, Joe Banks was the recipient. The selection was based on his placement of gardens at various locations in and out of the Borough using traditional flowers interspersed with vegetable plants.

At the **2003** dinner, Michael Pilato was given the Ingrid. Michael was instrumental in beginning and for placing several murals throughout State College.

Fred Fernsler received the award in **2004** for his design of many buildings such as the Alpha Fire Hall and Beaver Gardens and Borough projects including the Pugh Street garage renovation.

At the **2005** dinner, Penn State University received the Ingrid for the outstanding design for many projects on campus, including the Shortlidge Mall, Penn State Downtown Theatre Center, the IST building, and Eastview Terrace.

In **2006**, Curtis Graham received the award for designing many business signs which add to the rich streetscape in the downtown.

In **2007**, the Schlow Centre Region Library received the Ingrid for outstanding design of a building that fits the synergy of the downtown.

The State Theatre was awarded the Ingrid in **2008** for their historic reconstruction of the theatre.

In **2009**, the Prime Property Group, for the property located at 700 West College Avenue

In **2010**, the The Arboretum at Penn State.

In **2011**, the Community Arts Collective.

In **2012**, Jeramar Enterprises, Jeramar Plaza, 200 block of South Allen

In **2013**, David A. Levy & Associates

In 2014, Phil Hawk, for his skill and craftsmanship in the area of stonework.

Holtzman Award Guidelines

In an effort for staff to understand the award criteria, a set of guidelines have been developed for use by the Design Review Board when considering award nominees. This following list is based on information from previous award recipients and will be used to determine the annual Holtzman Award recipient.

- Project is located in the Borough
- Match or maintain historic character of the property and/or neighborhood
- Enhancement benefits or beautifies a specific public area or the community
- Incorporates a piece of public art by local artist(s)
- Ability to be used for community events, weddings, educational activities etc.
- Discreet and appropriately scaled for the site
- Building materials are elegant
- Nice site with framing views
- Innovative use of plants, trees, vegetation, and/or landscape architecture
- Charitable use i.e. affordable housing
- Meets or exceeds the scope of development for the property or neighborhood
- Deemed a benchmark project
- Remodeled, expanded, improved
- Aesthetically pleasing tone
- Honor financial contributors to project
- Prominent façade
- Blending of two or more neighborhoods
- Bike trails, racks
- Use of sustainable products
- Historic preservation
- Functionality
- Outside seating and architecture
- Outstanding design features
- Builder/Designer/Artist contribution to community
- Strategically located
- Safe zone